

Area 1: Strategic Framework of PAR

<p>Principle 1</p>	<p>The government has developed and enacted an effective public administration reform agenda that addresses key challenges</p>
<p>Principle approach</p>	<p>The monitoring approach for this principle entails focus on the involvement of the civil society organisations and public, as external stakeholders in the development of the key strategic documents on PAR (those that constitute PAR agenda).</p>
<p>INDICATOR 1</p>	<p>Use of participatory approaches in the development of key strategic PAR documents.</p>
<p>Indicator focus and general methodological remarks</p>	<p>The indicator focuses on the existence and quality of the consultative process in the development of key strategic PAR documents.</p> <p>Key strategic PAR documents will be interpreted to mean:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Overall PAR strategic document; 2. PFM reform document; 3. Service delivery reform document (if applicable); 4. E-government reform document (if applicable); 5. Regulatory reform document (if applicable), and 6. HRM reform document (if applicable). <p>Key strategic documents include official strategies/strategic plans (and their action plans), plans/programmes (and their action plans), and any other type of PAR planning document developed for a period of at least two years, formally approved/adopted by the Government or parliament. For all elements under this indicator the incumbent documents are analysed (previous documents or previous versions of documents are not considered).</p> <p>For all elements under this indicator, focus groups with representatives of CSOs who participated in the consultation process will be conducted to gain first-hand qualitative data. Focus groups include representatives of not less than 6 different CSOs that regularly follow the PAR policy. To award points for each element, the results of focus groups need to corroborate the information from the official documents and interviews depending on the data sources for each element.</p>

INDICATOR ELEMENTS			
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.1	Consultations with civil society are conducted when the document(s) are developed	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultation reports and other official data; • Websites of responsible government bodies (lead institutions in charge of developing key strategic PAR documents); • Focus groups with CSOs
	Element methodology		Point allocation
	<p>For this element, the measurement looks at whether the key PAR document(s) are consulted with the civil society, during the process of their development, and before the formal adoption of the document(s).</p> <p>To be considered under this element, the consultation process has to fulfil at least the following criteria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Have the duration of at least 15 days - Entail publication of an invitation for contributions together with the draft document(s) through the website of the responsible government body - Entail at least one proactive invitation of the responsible government body to the CSOs (mainstream or social media, using the channels of consultative bodies or institutions in charge of CSO relations, etc.) - Entail at least one face-to-face or virtual (online) meeting with external stakeholders based on an open invitation and containing a discussion session/time slot <p>Analysis of consultation reports and official data of the PAR institutions is conducted.</p>		<p>0 points: No consultation with civil society conducted when the document(s) were developed (or if it was conducted for some key documents but not for the overall PAR strategy);</p> <p>1 point: Consultation conducted in the development of one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy;</p> <p>2 points: Consultation conducted in the development of all key strategic PAR documents</p> <p>Maximum points: 4</p>
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.2	Consultations with civil society are conducted in an early phase of the development of the document(s)	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultation reports and other official data; • Websites of responsible government bodies; • Focus groups with CSOs;
	Element methodology		Point allocation
	<p>For this element, measurement considers if key PAR document(s) are consulted with the civil society, in an early phase of the development process, so as to allow for a meaningful contribution by CSOs to the key policy directions. An early phase will be understood as the phase of scoping PAR-related agenda, problem identification, or formulation phase (determining the directions of PAR strategic document), and <u>before a draft document has been developed or published</u>. Consultation on an inception or concept document is accepted under this element.</p>		<p>0 points: No consultation with civil society conducted in the early phase of developed document(s) (or if it was conducted for some key documents but not for the overall PAR strategy);</p>

	Researchers conduct an analysis of consultation reports and official data of the PAR institutions to identify the subject matter and discussion points of the consultation process.		<p>1 point: Consultation conducted in the early phase of developing of one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy ;</p> <p>2 points: Consultation conducted in the early phase of the development of all key strategic PAR documents;</p> <p>Maximum points: 4</p>
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.3	Invitations to civil society to participate in the consultations are open	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Websites of responsible government bodies; • Focus groups with CSOs; • Media analysis and social media
	Element methodology		Point allocation
	<p>For this element, measurement considers if invitations to the civil society to participate in the consultations are open and enable a wide reach across stakeholder groups.</p> <p>To award points, minimum one criterion of openness listed needs to be met:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Invitations are published on the website of sponsoring institutions/ministry, and where applicable on the portal/website for online public consultation; - Invitations sent through relevant partner institutions and organisations (e.g. offices for CSO relations/cooperation, partner CSOs, etc) – at least one such invitation; - Online forms for applying for participation in consultation events OR open online forms for submission of contributions. <p>For this element, analysis of official data and the websites of the PAR institutions will be conducted to analyse the means of inviting civil society and related documents.</p>		<p>0 points: Invitations to participate in the consultations are not open (or open for some key documents but not for the overall PAR strategy);</p> <p>1 point: Invitations to participate in the consultations are open for one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy;</p> <p>2 points: Invitations to participate in the consultations are open for all key strategic PAR documents;</p> <p>Maximum points: 4</p>
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.4	Responsible government bodies are proactive in ensuring that a wide range of external stakeholders become involved in the process	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Websites of responsible government bodies; • Focus groups with CSOs; • Interviews with relevant government institutions.
	Element methodology		Point allocation

	<p>For this element, proactive approach by the responsible government institutions will be understood to mean any initiative, invitation or meeting which particularly and deliberately targets stakeholders with particular interests and focuses. In particular, at least 3 out of four groups of stakeholders listed need to be proactively approached:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Business associations - Trade unions - Organisations focusing on gender equality and/or women organisations - Organisations dealing with the people with disabilities <p>For this element, analysis of official data and websites of the PAR institutions is conducted to analyse the means of inviting civil society and related documents.</p> <p>In addition, qualitative semi-structured interviews (up to three) with representatives of relevant government institutions will be conducted, to gain additional qualitative information on the government actions in this regard.</p>		<p>0 points: No proactivity on the part of responsible government bodies (or proactivity is ensured for some key documents but not for the overall PAR strategy);</p> <p>1 point: Proactive approach to involvement ensured in the process of developing one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy ;</p> <p>2 points: Proactive approach to involvement ensured in the process of developing all key strategic PAR documents;</p> <p>Maximum points: 2</p>
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.5	Civil society is provided complete information for preparation for consultations	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Websites of responsible government bodies; • Focus groups with CSOs; • Interviews with relevant government institutions.
	<p>Element methodology</p> <p>For this element, measurement considers if the information on the consultation process is complete, meaning that information accompanied by necessary information and materials, including at least:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. draft documents, and supporting documentation; b. Information on the duration of consultation process; c. Information on the way contributions are to be submitted (electronically, and/or physically/personally); <p>For this element, analysis of legal acts governing consultation process, and official data and the websites of the PAR institutions is conducted to analyse legal framework and practice of informing external stakeholders on the consultation process.</p> <p>In addition, qualitative semi-structured interviews (up to three) with representatives of relevant government institutions will be conducted to obtain additional qualitative information.</p>		<p>Point allocation</p> <p>0 point: Information on consultation process with civil society is incomplete (or it is incomplete for the overall PAR strategy);</p> <p>1 point: Information on consultation process is complete for one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy;</p> <p>2 points: Information on consultation process is complete for all key strategic PAR documents;</p>

			Maximum points: 4
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.6	Comments and inputs received in the consultation process are considered by the responsible government bodies in charge of developing key PAR strategic documents	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Websites of responsible government bodies; • Official consultation reports and other official data of responsible government bodies; • Focus groups with CSOs; • Interviews with relevant government institutions.
Element methodology			Point allocation
<p>For this element, researchers analyse the following documents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - official reports from consultations. - minutes of meetings where the comments received in the consultations were discussed and deliberated - where applicable, feedback reports/documents from the responsible government bodies. <p>In order to award points under this element, at least one of the data sources enumerated above need to contain concrete information on the consideration of individual comments received in the consultations.</p> <p>In addition, qualitative semi-structured interviews (up to three) with representatives of relevant government institutions will be conducted for an in-depth insight into the status of comments and inputs received and the concrete examples of how comments were considered.</p>			<p>0 points: No evidence found on consideration of individual comments for any of the key strategic PAR documents (or found for some documents but not for the overall PAR strategy)</p> <p>1 point: Evidence found on consideration of individual comments for one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy;</p> <p>2 points: Evidence found on consideration of individual comments for all key strategic PAR documents;</p> <p>Maximum points: 4</p>
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.7	Responsible government bodies publicly provide feedback on the treatment of received comments	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focus groups with CSOs; • Interviews with relevant government institutions; • Official reports from consultations; • Websites of responsible government bodies;
Element methodology			Point allocation
<p>For this element, researchers analyse if the responsible government bodies provide written feedback to the civil society on the comments and inputs received in the consultation. It is desirable that feedback is provided on individual comments and</p>			<p>0 points: No feedback is provided on the treatment of received comments for any of the key strategic PAR</p>

	<p>inputs (alternatively for groups or types of comments), rather than in general. In order to be considered for point awarding, feedback needs to be published online, rather than sent to individual organisations. It can be part of published consultation reports or it can be a separate document published online.</p> <p>Publishing can be done via official websites (PAR coordinator(s), e-government, government offices/bodies for cooperation with civil society and similar).</p> <p>To awards points, minimum criteria for providing feedback needs to be met:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. All comments are clearly visible per topics (subject of comments), either individually or in groups; 2. Senders are clearly indicated (exact names of organisations that sent them); 3. Statements are made on how comments were treated (accepted, partially accepted, rejected); 4. There is an explanation/justification of treatment. <p>Besides the analysis of official reports and other official data, qualitative semi-structured interviews (up to three) with representatives of relevant government institutions will be conducted, including questions related to the provision of feedback.</p>	<p>documents or feedback is not published online; (or no feedback provided for the overall PAR strategy);</p> <p>1 point: Feedback provided for one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy;</p> <p>2 points: Feedback provided for all key strategic PAR documents</p> <p>Maximum points: 2</p>	
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source
E.8	Responsible government bodies engage in open dialogue with civil society on contested questions	1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Official reports from consultations; • Focus groups with CSOs; • Interviews with responsible government bodies;
	<p>Element methodology</p> <p>For this element, researchers will analyse if there have been follow-up discussions and exchange of opinions (open dialogue) between the responsible government bodies and civil society regarding any contested issues arising from the consultation process. Points will be awarded if there has been dialogue, regardless of whether it was initiated by the government or CSO side.</p> <p>To determine if such dialogue has taken place, expert assessment of any meeting minutes and/or other reports will be done. In addition, qualitative semi-structured interviews (up to three) with representatives of relevant government institutions and focus groups with representatives of CSOs who participated in</p>	<p>Point allocation</p> <p>0 points: There is no dialogue on contested questions for any of the key strategic PAR documents (or there is dialogue for some but not for the overall PAR strategy);</p> <p>1 point: There is a dialogue on contested questions in the case of one key strategic document – overall PAR strategy;</p>	

	consultation will be used, to determine whether there is a practice of sufficient and active dialogue on contested issues (e.g. comments that were not accepted, issues that CSOs pushed for, but the responsible government bodies have rejected, or issues that were initially accepted, but later deleted in the inter-ministerial procedures, etc.) in consultation process. In order to award points, all three data sources need to corroborate the finding.							2 points: There is a dialogue on contested questions in the case of all key strategic PAR documents; Maximum points: 2
Element #	Element formulation	Weight	Element data source					
E.9	Consultations in the development of strategic PAR documents are open to the public	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Legislation on public debates/consultations • Official reports from consultations; • Focus groups with CSOs; • Interviews with responsible government bodies; 					
Element methodology			Point allocation					
<p>For this element, researchers analyse if any of the consultation process in the development of strategic PAR documents (analysed in elements 1 to 9) are also open to the wider public.</p> <p>To award points under this element, the following minimum criteria have to be met:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Online publication of a call to participate in public consultation/debate through the website of sponsoring institution/ministry, and a portal/website for publishing public consultation announcements (where applicable); - Publishing of draft/proposal of strategic document with a call; - Information on the ways/channels for submitting comments and inputs (through public consultation e-portal, in-person at the event, by email, by post, any combination of the mentioned, etc.) and contact information; 			<p>0 points: Consultations were not open to wider public (or were open for some of the key documents but not for the overall PAR strategy);</p> <p>1 point: Consultations were open to wider public for the overall PAR strategy;</p> <p>2 points: Consultations were open to wider public for all key strategic PAR documents;</p> <p>Maximum points: 4</p>					
TOTAL POINTS		0-5	6-10	11-15	16-20	21-25	26-30	
FINAL INDICATOR VALUE		0	1	2	3	4	5	